Edited by Camila de Gamboa Tapias and Bert van Roermund

Just Memories

Remembrance and Restoration in the Aftermath of Political Violence

25

SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

INTERSENTIA

How do memory and remembrance relate to the specific mode of transitional justice that lays emphasis on restoration? What is captured and what is obliterated in individual and collective efforts to come to terms with a violent past? Across this volume consisting of twelve in-depth contributions, the politics of memory in various countries are related to restorative justice under four headings: restoring trust, restoring truth, restoring land and restoring law. While the primary focus is a philosophical one, authors also engage in incisive analyses of historical, political and/or legal developments in their chosen countries. Examples of these include South Africa, Colombia, Rwanda, Israel and the land of Palestine, which they know all too well on a personal basis and from daily experience.

ISBN 978-1-78068-908-1

9 781780 689081

INTERSENTIA

intersentia.com

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements v
List of Contributors xi

Chapter 1. Introduction
Camila DE GAMBOA TAPIAS and Bert VAN ROERMUND 1

1. Transitional Justice, Restorative Justice and Memory: A Conceptual Framework 4
2. Justice, Remembrance and a Politics of Closure 9
3. Just Memories and a Politics of Disclosure 10

PART I. RESTORING TRUST

Chapter 2. The Duty to Remember a Violent Past: A Restorative (Re)Construction of Our Identity
Camila DE GAMBOA TAPIAS and Wilson HERRERA ROMERO 21

1. Introduction 21
2. The Construction of Identity and Tradition 22
3. Agency, Identity, and the Duty to Remember 25
4. The Perils of the Duty to Remember a Troublesome Past 30
5. Transforming Negative Identities 39
6. Conclusion 41

Chapter 3. Forgiveness, Reconciliation and Justice
Carlos THIEBAUT 45

1. Introduction 45
2. The Role of Forgiveness, Justice and Reconciliation in Harm Experiences 46
3. The Demand for a New Beginning: Forgiveness and Justice 52
4. The Voices of Forgiveness 57
5. The Forms and Processes of Forgiving 60
6. Conclusion 65

Chapter 4. Resentment and the Limits of a Politics of Memory: Justice vs. Time
Antonio Gómez Ramos 69

1. Introduction 69
2. Time and the Duty of Memory 70
3. Justice in Time: A Model for a Politics of Memory 71
4. Justice vs. Time: Resentment 76
5. Natural Time, Reflective Time and Forgiveness 82
6. Conclusion 85

PART II. RESTORING TRUTH

Chapter 5. Anamnesis – Or Reparation as Responsive Remembrance
Bert van Roermund 91

1. Introduction 92
2. "Never Again": Three Overly Simple Strategies 92
3. Remembrance, History and Time 96
4. Anamnesis 102
5. Conclusion: Re-Reading "Never Again" 106

Chapter 6. Reflections on the Work of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa: Memory, Counter-Memory and Restorative Justice
Anél Marais 113

1. Introduction 113
2. From Political Iniquity to Truth and Reconciliation 115
3. Truth and Truths 119
4. Untimely Meditations, Counter-Truth(s) and the Archive 123
5. Conclusion 132

Chapter 7. "Begging to be Black": Liminality and Critique in Post-Apartheid South Africa
Stewart Motha 135

1. Introduction: From Anti-Colonial Longing to Postcolonial Becoming 137
2. Becoming Minor 139
3. Becoming Sovereign 146
4. Liminality and Interconnectedness 149
5. Conclusion: Restoring Being-Becoming 155

PART III. RESTORING LAND

Chapter 8. Limitations to the Principle of *Restitutio in Integrum* and Full Reparations in Transitional Justice Contexts: What Reparation does not Repair
Beira Aguilar Rubiano 159

1. Introduction 160
2. The Development of the Field of Transitional Justice and the Model of Reparation 164
3. The Focus on Reparation with an Emphasis on the Restitution of Rights 169
4. Problems Regarding Land Restitution and Reparation 175
5. Conclusions 186

Chapter 9. Problems and Inconsistencies in the Protection of Women in the Colombian Land Restitution Process
Lina M. Céspedes Báez 191

1. Introduction 191
2. Women in Conflict: A Normative Category 194
3. The Colombian Land Restitution Process, a Case of Hybridization 197
4. The Gap between Sexual Violence and the Land Restitution Process 202
5. The Impact of an Imprecise Diagnosis: A Flattened Notion of Women in Conflict 206
6. Conclusion: Returning to Private Law? 214

Chapter 10. Letting Go and Creating New Opportunities in Palestinian Women's Words: "'They' Entered and Took 'us'"
Fatma Kassem 221

1. Introduction 221
2. A Meta-National Narrative 222
3. Contested Cities 226
4. Words as Expression of Power Relations 227
5. Micro–Macro Forms of Patriarchal Violence 230
6. Healing Wounds by Women's Agency 233
7. Familial National Formation 233
8. Conclusion 238

PART IV. RESTORING LAW

Chapter 11. Legal Argumentation in Transitional Justice Adjudication: A Land of New Arguments, a Land of New Law
Juan Francisco Soto Hoyos 243

1. Introduction 245
2. Transitional Justice Adjudication: A Theoretical Inquiry 247
3. Paving the Way for a Transitional Justice Adjudication Model 254
4. Testing the Model in Practice: "Colombia's Land Restitution Process" 261
5. Conclusion 275

Chapter 12. The Interplay between History, Tradition and Local Agency in Shaping Rwanda's Future: Beyond Gacaca
Felix Mukwiza Ndahinda 281

1. Introduction 281
2. Identity, Agency and Legitimacy in Post-Colonial Governance 283
3. *U Rwanda Rushya*: The Politics of Post-Genocide Reconstruction in Rwanda 285
4. *Ubutabera* or Justice in the Post-Genocide Landscape 289
5. *Kwibuka* or Memorialisation of Genocide Victims 293
6. Plurality of Transitional Processes in Shaping a "New Rwanda" 295
7. Managing the Past, Shaping the Future: An Appraisal 305

Chapter 13. Unconventional Restorative Justice and the Diplomacy of Closure: The Israeli Policy on the Armenian Genocide and the Geopolitics of Memory
Eldad Ben Aharon 313

1. Introduction 314
2. Conceptual Framework and Methodology 314
3. The Diplomacy of Closure 316
4. Early Years of Israel's Armenian Genocide Policy (1983–1988) 321
5. Post-Cold War: Interim Period (1989–2000) 325
6. From the Millennium Onwards: Third Period (2001–2016) 329
7. Conclusion: The Two-Level Game and the Diplomacy of Closure 336

Index 341

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Beira Aguilar Rubiano is an assistant professor at the Escuela de Ciencias Humanas, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia.

Eldad Ben Aharon is a university lecturer at the Leiden University Institute for Area Studies; the Netherlands; he obtained his PhD at the Holocaust Research Institute, Department of History, Royal Holloway, University of London, United Kingdom.

Lina M. Céspedes Báez is a titular professor at the Facultad de Jurisprudencia, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia.

Camila de Gamboa Tapias is an associate professor at the Centro de Estudios sobre Paz y Conflictos, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia.

Antonio Gómez Ramos is an associate professor of philosophy at the University Carlos III, Madrid, Spain.

Wilson Herrera Romero is an associate professor at the Escuela Ciencias Humanas and director of the Center for Teaching Ethics and Citizenship – Phronimos, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia.

Fatma Kassem holds a PhD from the Department of Behavioral Sciences at Ben-Gurion University of the Negev in Beer Sheva, Israel.

Anél Marais is a lecturer at the School of Law and Criminology of Aberystwyth University, Wales, United Kingdom.

Stewart Motha is professor of law at Birkbeck School of Law, University of London, United Kingdom.

Felix Mukwiza Ndahinda is the director of Research, Policy and Higher Education (RPHE) at the Aegis Trust; an honorary associate professor at the University of Rwanda Law School; and a research fellow at Tilburg University, the Netherlands.

Juan Francisco Soto Hoyos is a professor at the Facultad de Jurisprudencia, Universidad del Rosario, Bogotá, Colombia, and a consultant at the Comisión Colombiana de Juristas.

Carlos Thiebaut is a professor of philosophy, focusing on contemporary moral and political philosophy in particular, at Universidad Carlos III, Madrid, Spain.

Bert van Roermund is professor of philosophy (em) in the Department of Public Law and Governance at Tilburg Law School, the Netherlands.

CHAPTER 9

PROBLEMS AND INCONSISTENCIES IN THE PROTECTION OF WOMEN IN THE COLOMBIAN LAND RESTITUTION PROCESS

Lina M. Céspedes Báez

1. Introduction 191
2. Women in Conflict: A Normative Category 194
3. The Colombian Land Restitution Process, a Case of Hybridization 197
4. The Gap between Sexual Violence and the Land Restitution Process 202
5. The Impact of an Imprecise Diagnosis: A Flattened Notion of Women in Conflict 206
   5.1. Woman vs. Woman: Who is the Victim? 209
   5.2. The Dispensability of the Differential Perspective 211
   5.3. When Protecting Women Might Play against Women 212
6. Conclusion: Returning to Private Law? 214

1. INTRODUCTION

This contribution to a book about restoration in the aftermath of political violence is a snapshot of a particular moment in the quest for truth, justice, and reparation for victims in the context of the Colombian armed conflict. It aims to explore the promises and shortcomings of restorative justice from a feminist legal standpoint through the examination of the introduction of the gender perspective in the land restitution scheme that the Colombian state put in place in 2011. In this sense, it explores the intersection between law, as a means to achieve accountability, land tenure, as the embodiment of the most salient form of property, and women, as a category minted to redress discrimination and violence against a particular group. It is based on research that the author undertook for a doctoral degree in law and speaks to a longstanding interest in the interplay between gender, armed conflict, and property. It relies on a reading

Tribunal Superior de Bogotá – Sala Civil Especializada en Restitución de Tierras. *Diciembre 18 De 2013, Rad. 50001 31 21 001 2012 00082/90/06/24/33 01* 2013a.

—— *Julio 4 De 2013, Rad. 50001 31 21 001 2012 00117* 2013b.

—— *Mayo 14 De 2013, Rad. 50001 31 21 01 2012 00083 01* 2013c.

—— *Octubre 24 De 2013, Rad. 50001 31 21 001 2012 00092 01* 2013d.

—— *Septiembre 22 De 2014, Rad. 50001 31 21 02 2013 00086 01* 2014.

—— *Septiembre 23 De 2013, Rad. 50001 31 21 001 2012 000110 01* 2013.

Tribunal Superior de Cali – Sala Civil Especializada en Restitución de Tierras. *Febrero 7 De 2014, Rad. 761113121001-2012-00030-00* 2014.

Tribunal Superior de Cartagena – Sala Civil Especializada en Restitución de Tierras. *Febrero 11 De 2014, Rad. 20-001-31-21-001-2012-00222-00* 2014.

Tribunal Superior de Cúcuta – Sala Civil Especializada en Restitución de Tierras. *Agosto 12 De 2014, Rad. 540012221002-2013-00004-00* 2014a.

—— *Enero 22 De 2014, Rad. 2013-00051* 2014b.

—— *Febrero 25 De 2014, Rad. 540012221002-2013-00086-00* 2014c.

—— *Octubre 22 De 2014, Rad. 540012221002-2013-00147-00* 2014d.

—— *Octubre 31 De 2014, Rad. 540012221002-2013-00122-00* 2014e.

Tribunal Superior del Distrito de Cartagena – Sala Civil Especializada en Restitución de Tierras. *Agosto 27 De 2013, Rad. 200013121001-2012-00143-00* 2013a.

—— *Mayo 9 De 2013, Rad. 200013121001-2012-00141-00* 2013b.

Tribunal Superior del Distrito Judicial de Bogotá, Sala Civil Especializada en Restitución de Tierras. *Agosto 26 De 2013, Rad. 2012-00088*, 2013.

Unidad de Planificación Rural Agropecuaria (2014). *Bases Conceptuales. Procesos De Regularización De La Propiedad Rural y Acceso De Tierras.*

Weinrib, E.J. (2012) *The Idea of Private Law*. Cambridge M.A.: Harvard University Press.

Wills, M.E. (2007) *Inclusión sin Representación. La Irrupción de las Mujeres en Colombia (1970–2000)*. Colombia: Editorial Norma.

Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children (1999). *La Farsa De La Preocupación: El Abandono De La Población Desplazada Por La Violencia En Colombia*. New York.